

RODRIGO J. MORALES

# The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel

*Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen  
zum Neuen Testament 2. Reihe*

282

---

**Mohr Siebeck**

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen  
zum Neuen Testament · 2. Reihe

Herausgeber / Editor

Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber / Associate Editors

Friedrich Avemarie (Marburg)

Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford)

Hans-Josef Klauck (Chicago, IL)

282





Rodrigo J. Morales

# The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel

New Exodus and New Creation Motifs in Galatians

Mohr Siebeck

RODRIGO J. MORALES, born 1976; 2002 Master of Theological Studies degree in biblical studies from the University of Notre Dame; 2007 Ph. D. in New Testament from Duke University; assistant professor of theology at Marquette University in Milwaukee, Wisconsin.

e-ISBN PDF 978-3-16-151625-2

ISBN 978-3-16-150435-8

ISSN 0340-9570 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2. Reihe)

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

© 2010 by Mohr Siebeck, Tübingen, Germany.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed by Laupp & Göbel in Nehren on non-aging paper and bound by Buchbinderei Nädele in Nehren.

Printed in Germany.

*For my parents*



## Acknowledgements

The present study is a lightly revised and expanded version of the doctoral thesis I submitted to the Graduate Program in Religion at Duke University in April 2007. I would like to thank Prof. Jörg Frey for accepting this work as part of the *WUNT II* Series. I would also like to thank Dr. Henning Ziebritzki, Ms. Anna Krüger, and the editorial staff of Mohr Siebeck for their invaluable help in seeing the project to completion.

It is not until one works on a project of this length that one realizes that the lengthy acknowledgements typically found at the beginning of such works are anything but lip service. The present study would be far worse were it not for the support, guidance, and good humor of my professors, friends, and family.

The first word of thanks goes to the members of my committee. From the first time I interacted with him as an undergraduate in his Introduction to the New Testament course, Richard Hays has shown himself to be a model Christian scholar. He directed this work with characteristic wisdom and generosity of spirit. For his sound advice, perceptive criticism, and genuine excitement for my thesis, as well as his continued help and support in the publication process, I am deeply grateful. Ellen Davis kindly read each chapter in draft form and offered wise and incisive comments, as well as constant encouragement throughout the process. Joel Marcus's insightful questions and keen critical eye helped me to clarify my thinking, as well as my prose and argumentation. Additionally, he helped make it possible for me to spend a research semester at the University of Durham, which proved crucial to the development of the project. Warren Smith asked stimulating theological questions that pushed me to think more carefully about the theological implications of my exegesis and was a source of encouragement during the final stages of writing.

Thanks are due also to members of the Department of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Durham. I wrote the first draft of the central chapter of the thesis there in the spring of 2006 while participating in the Duke-Durham Exchange Program. I am grateful to Duke's Graduate Program in Religion and the Department of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Durham, as well as to both universities, for this opportunity. During my time there John Barclay was the epitome of graciousness, both as a host and as a reader. My indebtedness to his work is evident in chapter five

of the present study, but most of all it was the conversations we had that spring that refined my thinking on Galatians 3-4. Loren Stuckenbruck also gave generously of his time to work through the spirit references in the Dead Sea Scrolls, which helped to shape the direction of chapters three and four. I am also grateful for the feedback I received on a portion of my research that I presented at the departmental New Testament Seminar.

Third, I would like to thank the many friends who helped me through this process. In various ways Kavin Rowe, Daniel Kirk, Steve Turnbull, Leroy Huizenga, Brad Trick, Tim Wardle, Sarah Johnson, Matt Thiessen, Colin Miller, T.J. Lang, Nathan Eubank, Brant Pitre and Bill Wright contributed to my work, whether by reading and commenting on it or by offering advice and outlets for venting. Hans Arneson offered helpful feedback and much needed encouragement during the finishing stages of the initial project. A special word of thanks goes to Dave Moffitt. It was conversations with him that helped me find a topic, and he graciously read and commented on much of the work-in-progress.

Thanks also go to my graduate assistant for the 2009-2010 academic year, Geoff Holsclaw, who helped me with proofreading and with double-checking the indices.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents, Tarsicio and Milagros Morales. They have been a constant source of support throughout my studies and my life in general, and it is with sincere and profound gratitude that I dedicate this work to them.

Solemnity of St. Joseph, 2010

Rodrigo J. Morales

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments.....	VII
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Status Questionis.....	1
Thesis.....	4
Significance.....	5
Outline of the Argument.....	6
Methodology.....	7
A Note on Terminology: “Restoration Eschatology” and “Restoration of Israel”.....	10
<b>Chapter 2. New Exodus, New Creation I: The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in the OT Prophetic Literature.....</b>	<b>13</b>
Introduction.....	13
Methodology.....	14
The Spirit and Restoration Eschatology in Isaiah.....	15
Isaiah 11:1-16: Messiah, Spirit, Creation, Exodus.....	15
Isaiah 32:15-20: Righteousness, Peace, and the Spirit.....	18
Isaiah 42:1-9: The Servant and the Spirit.....	19
Isaiah 43:14-44:8: Seed, Blessing, King, Israel.....	20
Isaiah 48:16: The Lord GOD has sent me and his spirit.....	23
Isaiah 57:14-21 (LXX): The Spirit and Peace.....	23
Isaiah 59:15b-21: Spirit and Covenant.....	24
Isaiah 61:1-11: The Spirit and the Praise of the Nations.....	25
Isaiah 63:7-64:12: Spirit, Exodus, and Fatherhood.....	26
The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in Isaiah: Summary.....	28
The Spirit and Restoration Eschatology in Ezekiel.....	29
Ezekiel 11:14-21: New Spirit and Restoration.....	29
Ezekiel 18:30-32: New Heart and New Spirit.....	31
Ezekiel 36:16-38: The Restoration of Israel.....	32
Ezekiel 37:1-14: The Valley of Dry Bones.....	33

Ezekiel 39:21-29: The Restoration of Jacob.....	34
The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in Ezekiel: Summary.....	35
Excursus: Exile and the Heart in Deuteronomy .....	35
The Spirit and Restoration Eschatology in Joel .....	38
The Spirit and Restoration Eschatology in the Prophets: Summary.....	39
<b>Chapter 3. New Exodus, New Creation II: The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in the Second Temple Period.....</b>	<b>41</b>
Introduction.....	41
Methodology.....	42
<i>Jubilees</i> : Restoration, Adoption, and Spirit.....	43
<i>The Treatise on the Two Spirits</i> : The Spirits of Truth and Injustice.....	48
<i>The Words of the Luminaries</i> : Holy Spirit, Blessing, and Restoration.....	52
4Q521: The Messiah, the Spirit, and the Eternal Kingdom .....	55
The <i>Psalms of Solomon</i> : The Messiah’s Spirit and the Restoration .....	57
The <i>Similitudes of Enoch</i> : The Lord of the Spirits and the Spirit of the Elect One.....	60
The <i>Testament of Judah</i> : The Spirit of Sonship and Resurrection.....	64
The <i>Testament of Levi</i> : Spirit of Holiness and New Creation.....	68
Excursus: The Testaments of Judah and Levi: Christian, Jewish, or Admixture?.....	69
Hellenistic Judaism: The Spirit and no Restoration.....	73
Spirit and Restoration Eschatology in the Second Temple Period: Summary.....	75
<b>Chapter 4. New Exodus and the Spirit in Galatians 3-4: From Death to Life, From Slavery to Sonship.....</b>	<b>78</b>
Introduction .....	78
Methodology .....	80
Galatians 3:1-5: “Who has believed our message?”.....	81
Galatians 3:10-14: Life and Death, The Blessing and The Curse.....	86
The pattern of argumentation in Galatians 3.....	87
Galatians 3:10 and Deuteronomy 27:26.....	88
Galatians 3:11 and Habakkuk 2:4.....	96
Galatians 3:12 and Leviticus 18:5.....	100
Leviticus 18:5 in Ezekiel 20.....	101
Leviticus 18:5 in Nehemiah 9.....	103
Again, Galatians 3:12 and Leviticus 18:5.....	104
Galatians 3:13 and the “Curse of the Law”.....	105

Galatians 3:14 and the promise of the Spirit.....	109
Galatians 4:1-7: From Slavery to Sonship.....	114
The inheritance analogy in Galatians 4:1-2.....	115
Galatians 4:1-7 and Galatians 3:23-29.....	117
Galatians 4:1-2: the heir under guardians and stewards.....	118
Excursus: Israel as <i>νήπιος</i> , idolatry, and the knowledge of God.....	119
Galatians 4:3-7: New Exodus and the Spirit.....	121
The fullness of (the) time.....	123
The sending of the Son.....	123
The outpouring of the Spirit.....	126
No longer a slave but a son.....	129
Galatians 4:1-7: Summary.....	129
The Outpouring of the Spirit and the Galatian Situation.....	130
Conclusion.....	130
<b>Chapter 5. New Creation and the Spirit in Galatians 5-6:</b>	
<b>Bearing Fruit unto Eternal Life.....</b>	<b>132</b>
Introduction.....	132
Methodology.....	134
Galatians 5:2-6: Awaiting the Hope of Righteousness by the Spirit.....	135
Galatians 5:13-26: The Spirit and the Flesh.....	140
Excursus: The “Flesh” as a power?.....	141
Galatians 5:13-15: Fulfilling the Law.....	143
Galatians 5:16-18: The Spirit and the flesh.....	146
Galatians 5:19-21: The works of the flesh.....	151
Galatians 5:22-23: The fruit of the Spirit.....	155
Galatians 5:24-26: Crucifying the flesh, living by the Spirit.....	159
Galatians 6:1-2: Correction in the Spirit of Gentleness.....	160
Galatians 6:7-8: Reaping Eternal Life.....	161
Conclusion.....	163
<b>Chapter 6. Conclusion: The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel... 164</b>	
Summary.....	164
Major Contributions .....	168
Paul, the Spirit, and Second Temple Judaism.....	168
The Words of the Luminaries, the Curse of the Law, and the Outpouring of the Spirit.....	169
The Outpouring of the Spirit and the Blessing of Abraham.....	169
The Curse of the Law and Life and Death.....	170

Life and Death, the Spirit, and the Coherence of Galatians.....	171
Areas for Further Research.....	172
Galatians and Romans.....	172
The Commandments of God.....	172
Reconciliation and the Spirit.....	172
Bibliography.....	175
Index of Ancient Sources.....	185
Index of Modern Authors.....	197
Index of Subjects.....	199

## Chapter 1

### Introduction

At the outset of the central argument in the Letter to the Galatians, Paul asks his readers the question: “This alone I want to know from you: was it from works of the Law that you received the Spirit, or from the proclamation of faith?” (Gal 3:2).<sup>1</sup> From this point forward, the Spirit plays a crucial role in Paul’s argument, appearing at climactic moments in his case (3:13-14; 4:4-6; 4:29-31), as well as undergirding the final hortatory section of the epistle (5:5; 5:16-25; 6:8). The tone of the question, in addition to the rest of the argument, makes quite clear the answer that Paul expects to hear – the Galatians received the Spirit from the proclamation of faith. Although the answer to the question is obvious, the presupposition of that answer remains elusive: what significance does Paul attach to the reception of the Spirit? Perhaps equally puzzling, why does Paul connect the gift of the Spirit with the blessing of Abraham (Gal 3:13-14)? The present work seeks to answer these questions by exploring various OT prophetic themes that connect the outpouring of the Spirit with the restoration of Israel, and by tracing the development of these themes in the Second Temple period. The premise of the study is that these traditional Jewish expectations about the Spirit shed light on Paul’s argument in Galatians 3-6.

### Status Quaestionis

Although studies of Galatians since the time of the Reformation have focused primarily on the contentious issue of justification by faith, scholars have more recently begun to recognize the centrality of the Spirit in Paul’s argument. In a volume that presents a tradition-historical approach to Paul’s pneumatology, Johannes Vos devotes a chapter to the relationship between the Spirit and the inheritance of Abraham in Galatians.<sup>2</sup> In addition, Vos includes a chapter on salvation and the Spirit in the OT and in early Judaism.<sup>3</sup> Vos rightly acknowledges the connection between the gift of the Spirit and the inclusion of

---

<sup>1</sup> Unless otherwise noted, translations of the NT are my own.

<sup>2</sup> Johannes Sijko Vos, *Traditionsgeschichtliche Untersuchungen zur paulinischen Pneumatologie* (Assen: Van Gorcum, 1973), 85-106.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, 34-73.

the Gentiles within Paul's understanding of the covenant with Abraham. Moreover, he rightly notes that for Paul the gift of the Spirit comes about solely on the basis of the proclamation of the gospel. The main weakness in Vos's study is that with rare exception he fails to relate his treatment of the Spirit in the OT and Judaism to his interpretation of Galatians. Even when he does relate the two, he does so only by referring the reader back to the previous chapter without giving a detailed analysis of the points of overlap between Galatians and the OT.<sup>4</sup>

David Lull's *The Spirit in Galatia* explores the experience of the Spirit among the Galatians in two major sections.<sup>5</sup> In the first part, he argues that the initial reception of the Spirit took place in the context of preaching rather than baptism. The second part of the study then considers the significance of the Spirit for Paul under the headings of soteriology, Christology, and eschatology. Lull makes important connections in this second part, explaining the soteriological role of the Spirit in terms of the eschatological new creation to which Paul refers at the end of Galatians and connecting this latter term with Paul's reference to the kingdom of God and the Israel of God. Nevertheless, the study remains preliminary and largely underdeveloped. While Lull does well to redress the neglect of the Spirit in so many studies of Galatians and to highlight the significance of the Spirit on a global level, his discussion does not offer as much as one would hope for by way of probing exegetical analysis. Most noteworthy is the paucity of OT and Second Temple Jewish texts examined in the study.<sup>6</sup>

In *The Cross and the Spirit*, Charles Cosgrove also addresses the centrality of the Spirit in Paul's argument and makes a strong case that Gal 3:1-5 deserves more prominence in the discussion of Galatians than the history of interpretation has afforded it.<sup>7</sup> The central point of Cosgrove's study is that these verses open up a window into the problem Paul was addressing in Galatia: "[W]hether believers can promote their ongoing experience of the Spirit by doing the Law."<sup>8</sup> Cosgrove makes a compelling case that for Paul life in the Spirit and participation in the cross are inseparable. It is only through the cross, Paul argues, that the Galatians received the Spirit and can continue in

---

<sup>4</sup> For example, Vos (*Paulinische Pneumatologie*, 92-93) asserts that the primary background to Paul's understanding of the Spirit in Gal 3:6-14 is to be found in Deutero-Isaiah. Rather than giving a detailed comparison of texts, however, he simply refers the reader to the previous chapter on the Spirit in the OT.

<sup>5</sup> David J. Lull, *The Spirit in Galatia: Paul's Interpretation of Pneuma as Divine Power* (SBLDS 49; Ann Arbor: Scholars Press, 1980).

<sup>6</sup> Only three OT texts (Gen 21:10-12; Isa 54:1; Hosea 2:1) appear in the scripture index of the book, in addition to the apocryphal 2 Esdras 3:21-22; see *ibid.*, 225.

<sup>7</sup> Charles H. Cosgrove, *The Cross and the Spirit: A Study in the Argument and Theology of Galatians* (Macon: Mercer University, 1988).

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, 2.

the Spirit. Although in the course of his argument Cosgrove notes some of the Second Temple Jewish expectations about the Spirit, he does not fully explore the significance of these expectations for Paul's argument, nor does he sufficiently address the importance of restoration eschatology in Paul's reasoning. In effect, Cosgrove's work asks different questions than the present study. Whereas Cosgrove argues *that* the Spirit is a central issue in Galatians and that it is closely connected with the cross, he does not ask *why* the Spirit plays such a crucial role in Paul's argument.

Gordon Fee's study *God's Empowering Presence* devotes approximately one hundred pages to discussing the role of the Spirit in Galatians.<sup>9</sup> Fee reaches four conclusions with regard to the Spirit.<sup>10</sup> First, the Spirit has replaced the Torah as an "identity marker" for the Christian community. Second, the Spirit serves as the means of coming to completion in the Christian life. Third, the Spirit functions for Paul as "the main eschatological reality, the certain evidence that the future has begun and the guarantee of its consummation."<sup>11</sup> Finally, the Spirit serves as God's personal presence among Christians. In the course of his exegesis, Fee makes note of the various prophetic texts that connect the Spirit with new exodus imagery, but he does not explore the significance of these texts for Paul's argument. Moreover, Fee downplays the significance of developments in the intertestamental period for Paul's understanding of the Spirit, devoting a mere five and a half pages to discussion of the writings of that era.<sup>12</sup> One unfortunate result of this neglect is Fee's assertion that the "curse of the Law" in Gal 3:13-14 refers to Torah observance.<sup>13</sup>

Each of these four major studies acknowledges the eschatological significance of the Spirit for Paul, but none adequately develops the most pertinent background of the Spirit as an eschatological sign. Despite the many references to the "last age," the "new creation," "the new aeon," and other equivalent terms, none explores the prophetic texts that connect the Spirit with the restoration of Israel and the importance of the motifs associated with the Spirit for Paul's argument. Moreover, none of these works traces the development of these themes in the Second Temple period in order to establish the cultural and religious context in which Paul's argument most makes sense. A closer examination of the various expectations about the Spirit in both the OT and the Second Temple period will help to show how Paul's emphasis on the Spirit both corresponds to and deviates from his contemporary setting.

---

<sup>9</sup> Gordon D. Fee, *God's Empowering Presence: The Holy Spirit in the Letters of Paul* (Peabody: Hendrickson, 1994), 367-471.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, 469-71.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, 470.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, 910-15.

<sup>13</sup> *Ibid.*, 392.

## Thesis

The present study will demonstrate that the key to understanding the role of the Spirit in Galatians can be found in some of the OT Prophets and Jewish traditions stemming from those texts that associate the outpouring of the Spirit with the restoration of Israel. There is good *prima facie* evidence that prophecies of restoration, especially (though not limited to) those found in Isaiah, play a significant role in Paul's thought, particularly in Galatians. The term he uses to describe his message, "gospel," most likely has its roots in the good news proclaimed in the second half of Isaiah.<sup>14</sup> Furthermore, Paul describes his call and ministry in language drawn from that very section of Isaiah: "But when the one who set me apart from my mother's womb and called me through his grace was pleased to reveal his Son in me, in order that I might preach him among the Gentiles..." (Gal 1:15-16; cf. Isa 49:5-6; the description of Paul's being "set apart from his mother's womb" also resembles Jer 1:4, perhaps even more closely than Isa 49:5-6). Both the manner of Paul's call and his mission to the Gentiles dovetail with some of the central themes of Deutero-Isaiah.<sup>15</sup> It should not be surprising, therefore, to see restoration themes from both Isaiah and later appropriations of Isaiah undergirding the argument of the epistle.

This collocation of themes relating the Spirit, the heart, sonship, and the curses of Deuteronomy will help to shed light on how Paul understands the curse of the Law in Gal 3:10-14. *Pace* Fee, the curse Paul has in mind is not Torah observance in general, but rather the curse that the Law pronounces on the nation for failure to obey the covenant, as N. T. Wright and James M. Scott have independently argued.<sup>16</sup> The manifestation of the Spirit, I will argue, demonstrates Israel's redemption from the curse, and further illuminates Paul's references to the "kingdom of God" in Gal 5:21 and to the Christian community as the "Israel of God" in 6:16.<sup>17</sup> Indeed, eschatological expectations about the Spirit also undergird the hortatory argument in Galatians 5-6,

---

<sup>14</sup> See the discussion on pp. 81-86 below.

<sup>15</sup> For a persuasively argued reading of Romans along these lines, see J. Ross Wagner, Jr., *Heralds of the Good News: Isaiah and Paul in Concert in the Letter to the Romans* (Leiden: Brill, 2002).

<sup>16</sup> N. T. Wright, *The Climax of the Covenant: Christ and the Law in Pauline Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992), 137-56; see also *idem*, *The New Testament and the People of God* (Christian Origins and the Question of God 1; Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992); James M. Scott, "'For as Many as are of Works of the Law are Under a Curse' (Galatians 3.10)," in *Paul and the Scriptures of Israel* (ed. Craig A. Evans and James A. Sanders; JSNTSup 83; Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1993), 187-221. Scott's essay adumbrates some of the key themes to be explored in the present study.

<sup>17</sup> On the latter text see G. K. Beale, "Peace and Mercy Upon the Israel of God: The Old Testament Background of Galatians 6,16b," *Bib* 80 (1999): 204-23.

though in a way that stands traditional Jewish understandings of the Law on their head. This revisionary re-reading of Israel's history, though, is one of many threads that hold the hortatory section of the epistle together with the exegetical argument in Galatians 3-4.

## Significance

The present study makes several contributions to biblical scholarship. First, it provides a more detailed treatment of the connection between the Spirit and restoration eschatology in Second Temple Judaism than has been offered to date. Although some studies have appeared with brief overviews of the role of the Spirit in many texts of this period, for the most part these works tend not to provide detailed exegesis of some of the key texts. Rather, they offer summaries with a number of citations but little in-depth discussion.<sup>18</sup> Other works focus on different aspects of Spirit-endowment such as prophecy and inspired exegesis that have less bearing than restoration eschatology on Galatians.<sup>19</sup> The present study provides a fuller picture of the variety of eschatological expectations surrounding the Spirit in Second Temple Judaism. One important aspect of these expectations is the connection between the outpouring of the Spirit and redemption from the curses of the Law. This connection leads to a second contribution of the study.

The close association between the giving of the Spirit and the redemption of Israel, both in the Prophets and in the Second Temple period, helps to clarify Paul's understanding of the "curse of the Law" in Gal 3:13. The way that texts such as the *Words of the Luminaries* and the *Testament of Judah* describe the outpouring of the Spirit as the solution to Israel's status under the curses of Leviticus and/or Deuteronomy suggests that Paul's appeal to the Spirit functions in an analogous manner. In Galatians as in these other texts, the reception of the Spirit signals the redemption of Israel from the curse and the empowerment of believers to order their lives rightly before God.

---

<sup>18</sup> See, e.g., Robert P. Menzies, *The Development of Early Christian Pneumatology with special reference to Luke-Acts* (JSNTSup 54; Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1991), 53-76, and more recently Finny Philip, *The Origins of Pauline Pneumatology* (WUNT 2.194; Tübingen: Mohr/Siebeck, 2005), 77-88. Earlier exceptions to this deficiency are Max-Alain Chevallier, *L'Esprit et le Messie dans le bas-judaïsme et le Nouveau Testament* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1958) and *idem*, *Souffle de Dieu: le Saint-Esprit dans le Nouveau Testament* (Point Théologique 26; Paris: Éditions Beauchesne, 1978); the wider availability of texts, especially from Qumran, since the publication of Chevallier's works justifies a new study.

<sup>19</sup> See, e.g., John R. Levison, *The Spirit in First Century Judaism* (AGJU 29; Leiden; New York: Brill, 1997).

With respect to this understanding of the curse as that pronounced by Deuteronomy, the present study also advances the discussion about the substance of the curse. By paying close attention to the significance of life and death in the epistle, I offer an interpretation of the curse in Gal 3:10-14 that makes better sense of Paul and at the same time fits with Deuteronomy's own description of the curse. One feature of Paul's argument that distinguishes him from some of his contemporaries is his lack of clear reference to exile and return. In contrast to the emphasis on exile in both Deuteronomy and some texts from the Second Temple period, the category of exile is conspicuously absent in Paul's writings. Rather, the key categories for his understanding of the curse and of the Spirit are death and life, respectively, suggesting that Paul fundamentally interpreted the curse of Deuteronomy as consisting of death.<sup>20</sup>

The significance of this association between the Spirit and life in Galatians remains underdeveloped to date. The exploration of this association is a third major contribution of the present study. The contrast between life and death runs like a leitmotif throughout the epistle, beginning with Gal 2:15-21. Moreover, Paul fundamentally understands the contrast between the Spirit and the Law in terms of life and death. Whereas the Law is unable to make alive (Gal 3:21), the one who sows to the Spirit will reap eternal life (Gal 6:8). As will become evident through a careful exegesis of several of these passages, this contrast between life and death is a crucial one to make sense of how Galatians fits together as a whole.

## Outline of the Argument

Chapter two, "New Exodus, New Creation I: The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in the OT Prophetic Literature," traces the connection between the outpouring of the Spirit and the restoration of Israel in the OT prophetic corpus. By examining these themes in a number of passages from Isaiah, Ezekiel and Joel, the present work demonstrates that the gift of the Spirit was one important aspect of OT eschatological expectations. Moreover, I show that this hope can be expressed with a variety of images. Rather than depicting a monolithic eschatological program, the prophets variously associate the Spirit with fruitfulness, the renewal of the heart, sonship and several other motifs. In addition, these themes most often appear in the context of descriptions of a new exodus and/or a new creation – a significant point for understanding Paul's emphasis at the end of Galatians on "new creation" (Gal 6:16).

Equally important for our understanding of Paul's argument is the development of these eschatological motifs in the so-called intertestamental period,

---

<sup>20</sup> As we will see, Deuteronomy itself often describes the curse in terms of death.

which is the focus of the third chapter, “New Exodus, New Creation II: The Spirit and the Restoration of Israel in the Second Temple Period.” Paul did not write in a vacuum, but in the world of first-century Judaism. An exploration of the themes of the Spirit and restoration in such literature as the *Psalms of Solomon*, the *Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs*, *Jubilees*, the Dead Sea Scrolls, and other pseudepigraphical literature will help to demonstrate that such expectations continued to influence first century Jewish beliefs in a variety of texts and genres.

The fourth chapter, “New Exodus and the Spirit in Galatians 3-4: From Death to Life, From Slavery to Sonship,” provides exegetical probes of three key texts with respect to the Spirit in Galatians 3-4 (Gal 3:1-5; 3:10-14; 4:1-7). In particular, it focuses on the role of the Spirit with regard to questions of the curse of the Law and sonship. Moreover, it addresses the question of the inheritance of Abraham referred to in Galatians 3, demonstrating that Paul reads the promises to Abraham through the Galatians’ experience of the Spirit in light of the eschatological expectations of the time. For Paul, in other words, the gift of the Spirit fulfills the promise to Abraham, albeit in a transposed key in terms of the worldwide restoration of Israel via the mission to the Gentiles and the heavenly Jerusalem.

The eschatological outpouring of the Spirit also undergirds Paul’s ethical arguments in Galatians 5-6, the subject of the fifth chapter, “New Creation and the Spirit in Galatians 5-6: Bearing Fruit Unto Eternal Life.” Much of Paul’s argument regarding so-called ethical issues relies heavily on the gift of the Spirit. Although the textual connections with the OT and Second Temple literature are not as strong in Galatians 5-6, this chapter shows that thematically Paul’s argument continues to presuppose the inauguration of the eschatological age as described in the Prophets and the Second Temple period.

## Methodology

It is important to note at the outset that, with a few exceptions, the present study does not argue that Paul consciously alludes to the specific OT and Second Temple texts considered in chapters two and three. Rather, the purpose of exploring these texts is to establish the kinds of expectations that were available to Paul and his contemporaries.<sup>21</sup> There are different reasons for

---

<sup>21</sup> The present study thus differs methodologically from Richard B. Hays, *Echoes of Scripture in the Letters of Paul* (New Haven: Yale University, 1989). Whereas Hays sought to understand Paul as a reader of Scripture, my goal is to demonstrate how Second Temple Jewish expectations about the Spirit shape Paul’s argument. Although this will necessarily involve some discussion of how Paul interprets texts, the focus is not so much on Paul’s hermeneutical approach or on detecting conscious allusions as it is on themes that appear in a

examining the OT and the Second Temple literature. Since they were available to Paul, the OT texts present a reliable source for the themes and images that he uses. The Second Temple literature shows which of these texts still influenced eschatological expectations among Jews of the period, as well as which themes tended to appear together, and so provide a helpful body of literature to compare with Paul's use of OT imagery.

Because the focus of the study is on Second Temple Jewish understandings of the outpouring of the Spirit as they reflect earlier prophetic expectations, the reader will note that chapter two on the Spirit in the OT Prophets makes little note of modern distinctions between redactional layers in the texts. The reason for this approach can be stated quite simply: neither Paul nor his Second Temple Jewish contemporaries and near contemporaries would have read OT texts in this way, and so the results of source, form and redaction criticism have little to no bearing on the appropriation of themes from the OT in the Second Temple period. On the other hand, one must take care not to assume that Jews of this period read their sacred books in a manner analogous to contemporary canonical criticism.<sup>22</sup> The goal of the second chapter, then, is to set forth all of the images that were available both to Paul and to his contemporaries relating the outpouring of the Spirit to the restoration of Israel. In some ways my approach shares a number of similarities with Francis Watson's recent contribution to Pauline studies.<sup>23</sup> The present work investigates the relationship between Israel's Scriptures on the one hand and Second Temple Jewish and Pauline reception of those Scriptures on the other. The main difference between my approach and Watson's is that whereas Watson focuses on explicit citation and interpretation of OT texts, the present work considers how broader OT and Second Temple themes shape Paul's understanding of the Spirit, for the most part without asserting whether or how Paul was consciously interpreting the scriptural texts about the Spirit.

This articulation serves as a helpful transition to what I intend to achieve with respect to Galatians in the present work. As has already been noted, the goal of the study is not to suggest that Paul alludes to all or any of the texts discussed in chapters two and three. Rather, the analysis of these texts serves to describe one "encyclopedia" of late Second Temple Jewish expectations regarding the Spirit and the restoration of Israel in order to show how Paul's argument fits within his cultural context.<sup>24</sup> Any such approach, however, runs

---

variety of texts and as a result influence the language and imagery that Paul highlights in his own argument.

<sup>22</sup> See, e.g., John Barton, *Oracles of God: Perceptions of Ancient Prophecy in Israel after the Exile* (New York: Oxford University, 1986), 149-51.

<sup>23</sup> Francis Watson, *Paul and the Hermeneutics of Faith* (New York: T&T Clark, 2004).

<sup>24</sup> I borrow the term "encyclopedia" from Umberto Eco (*A Theory of Semiotics* [Bloomington: Indiana University, 1979]). Eco uses the word to describe the various possibilities of conveying meaning with concrete "contextual and circumstantial selections" (p. 105). The

the risk of appearing arbitrary – how does one legitimately choose which texts shed light on Galatians? One helpful way to address the question is to think in terms of multiply attested collocations of themes.<sup>25</sup> In other words, each text considered in chapters two and three does not stand on its own, but rather gains significance for Paul’s thought when it shares a number of themes with other texts and with Galatians. So, for example, Isa 44:3, 4Q504, and the *Testament of Judah* all in some way connect the outpouring of the Spirit with the blessing, and the latter two texts do so in contexts that speak of Israel’s suffering under the curses of Deuteronomy and/or Leviticus. When these themes appear together in Galatians 3 in the context of Paul’s discussion of the curse of the Law, it seems probable that he is tapping into and addressing an expectation available in various circles of Second Temple Judaism. As we will see, Paul’s argument often reflects certain patterns found in a number of the texts we consider below, but perhaps equally as often he modifies or challenges those patterns. Even if Paul did not know any of the texts discussed in chapter three of the present study, many of the themes that they employ are present in the OT prophetic texts available to Paul. Like many of his contemporaries, Paul most likely often used these motifs without consciously alluding to the OT texts in which the themes feature prominently.<sup>26</sup>

---

meaning a speaker or listener associates with a given word or set of words depends on the speaker’s historical and cultural context. Eco uses the example of the word “whale,” which connotes different things in ancient and modern contexts, and within modern contexts in scientific as opposed to literary settings (pp. 112-14). In the present study, we will seek to describe an “encyclopedia” of images and ideas associated with the outpouring of the Spirit for Paul as a first-century Jew familiar with the Scriptures of Israel living in a time of expectation about the Spirit and the restoration of Israel. I should also note that the primary goal of this study is to make sense of Paul’s argument irrespective of how his audience would have received it. This is not to deny that Galatians is a contingent text addressing specific historical circumstances in the Galatian churches. Rather, it is to affirm that the primary object of study is Paul’s argument, not a reconstruction of the make-up of the Galatian churches. On the problematic nature of the biblical literacy of Paul’s congregations, see Christopher D. Stanley, “‘Pearls Before Swine’: Did Paul’s Audiences Understand his Biblical Quotations?” *NovT* 41 (1999): 124-44; idem, *Arguing with Scripture: The Rhetoric of Quotations in the Letters of Paul* (New York/London: T&T Clark, 2004), 38-61.

<sup>25</sup> I owe this formulation to a private conversation with James Scott. For a similar approach articulated in terms of tradition and its interpretations, see Sylvia C. Keesmaat, *Paul and his Story: (Re)interpreting the Exodus Tradition* (JSNTSup 181; Sheffield: Sheffield Academic, 1999), 15-53.

<sup>26</sup> For a recent articulation of a similar approach to the relationship between Israel’s Scriptures and Paul’s writings, see Roy E. Ciampa, “Scriptural Language and Ideas,” in *As it is Written: Studying Paul’s Use of Scripture* (ed. Stanley E. Porter and Christopher D. Stanley; SBLSymS 50; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2008), 41-57.